

Rhetorical Visions of Unmarried Mothers

Thomas G. Endres

Bormann's fantasy theme analysis and Q-methodology are combined to examine the symbolic reality of unmarried mothers. A dramatic humanistic analysis of rhetoric produced by and about unmarried mothers identifies three rhetorical visions: the Down and Out Vision, the Making the Best Vision, and the Yummie Vision. The visions are composed of fantasy themes, types, and cues in relation to the following issues: Parents, Birthfather, Society, Relationship with the child, Disclosure, New men, Loneliness, Control, and the Future. Images from the rhetorical analysis are transferred to a Q-sort card deck and sorted by 64 unmarried mothers into a "most like me—least like me" continuum. QUANAL is used to identify the extent to which unmarried mothers accept or reject the dramas about them. Five transcendent type rhetorical visions are identified within the subject pool, and these visions are discussed and interpreted in light of the rhetorical analysis. Communicative implications and suggestions for future study are also provided.

KEY CONCEPTS BORMANN, Fantasy theme analysis, Q methodology, Q sort, Quanal, Rhetorical Vision

THOMAS G. ENDRES (Ph.D) is an Assistant Professor in the Speech-Theater Department, St. Olaf College, Northfield, MN 55057.

Unmarried mothers constitute a large and ever-growing percentage of our country's demographic structure. Though exact numbers may be difficult to verify, incidences of out of wedlock births appear to be on the increase. The U.S. Census figures from 1980 show that 18% of all live births were to single women. According to the Department of Health and Human Services, that represents an 11.4% increase from the previous census. Two factors, antithetical in nature, combine to make this an issue of great social relevance. The first issue of concern is that adolescent pregnancies are on the rise, with over one million teenage girls (approximately two in twenty) becoming pregnant annually (Witt & Michael, 1982). Secondly, there has also been an increase in the number of women in their thirties who have opted for single parenthood. Morrisroe (1983) states that the birth rate for women aged 30 to 34 has risen more than for any other age group of single mothers.

Such large scale changes certainly impact the way that society must view out of wedlock pregnancy and unmarried mothers. So, too, must it impact the way that these mothers view themselves. Unfortunately, many unmarried mothers are often at a loss to define themselves or their situation. The messages they receive from their social network may be outdated, conflicting, and confusing. As Klein (1973) notes, we "must view today's unmarried pregnant girl against a backdrop of social realities that

are far more flexible than they have ever been before (p. 28)." Klein goes on to berate the use of limited and negative stereotypes used to classify these women, as "it is an injustice to the single parent experience not to see how nonhomogeneous a group single parents can be. Like any other behaviour, unmarried motherhood has a variety of meanings in the light of a particular person's life (p. 64)." The very flexibility of this backdrop creates a problem, however, when the unmarried mother attempts to define her new identity and discovers that she has no common linkage to a million other women in her same situation.

These feelings of isolation are fostered by comments from authors who, in their attempt to combat stereotyping, refer to the millions of unwed mothers, "each with her own story" (Oettinger & Mooney, 1979). Typical of this is Hansen's (1980) decision-making guide on unmarried pregnancy, in which the women are told, "No matter if a million young women find themselves pregnant and single every year, your exact combination of personality and background and circumstances will never be duplicated (p. 11)."

It is difficult to believe, however, that such a pervasive element of our society could be entirely chaotic. What was needed was a research project that could examine the complicated and seemingly unrelated definitions of unwed motherhood, and assess the extent to which those definitions are used by the unwed mother as she searches to understand herself and her experiences.

The goal of this study was to identify which elements of the "backdrop of social realities" come into play in an unmarried mother's view of herself. This was accomplished through a humanistic dramatic analysis of the messages made available to the unmarried mother through her rhetorical community. Bormann's (1972, 1982a) fantasy theme analysis was used to identify and examine the recurrent and shared dramatic storylines that exist by and about single women with children. The appropriateness of the methodology can be seen in Golden, Berquist, and Coleman's (1983) statement:

People seldom understand events in all their complexity. Yet most human beings have a desire to understand some of the things that happen around them and to them. The way they come to some understanding is by participating in fantasy themes in which an explanation for events is acted out by the personae in the dramas (p. 436).

As such, when individuals or collectives produce and share fantasies, they can make sense out of the experiences that prior to that may have been confusing. To examine the link between the rhetoric and the audience, the images discovered in the rhetorical analysis were then presented to a subject pool of unmarried mothers, and Q-methodology was used to identify whether or not certain women share similar composite sets of fantasies, or rhetorical visions.

Fantasy/Q-Methodology and Communication Study

While no communication research currently exists on unmarried mothers, fantasy theme analysis and Q-methodology are gaining popularity as research methods for identifying and understanding the symbolic realities of specified rhetorical communities. Bormann first introduced the idea of fantasy theme analysis in this seminal 1972 article. He and his colleagues have further explicated the methodology over the last fifteen years (e.g. Bormann, 1980; Bormann, 1982a; Bormann, 1985; Cragan &

Shields, 1981). Fantasy is a technical term which refers to the "creative and imaginative interpretation of events that fulfills a psychological or rhetorical need" (Bormann, 1985, p. 5). In this study, the term fantasy is used synonymously with the terms images, storylines, dramas, and scenarios. These terms may refer to either fictitious or non-fictitious stories.

The actual content of the message in which the fantasy is elicited is called the fantasy theme; complete scenarios which contain major dramatic elements such as *dramatis personae* (characters), plotline, scene, and sanctioning agent (justification of the drama). When these symbolic units are shared, they constitute the base of social reality. Once an individual has shared in the drama of a fantasy theme, they may then be able to understand and respond to rhetorical imagery of either a fantasy type or an inside-cue. The fantasy type is a stock scenario that has been repeated again and again with the identical or similar characters, scenes, and outlines. An inside-cue is a cryptic symbolic allusion, such as a code word, gesture, slogan, or phrase that evokes the same response from the individual as did the originally shared fantasy theme.

When a variety of dramas come together to form composite views for a collective, this is known as a rhetorical vision. Bormann (1985) describes this as "a unified putting together of the various scripts which gives the participant a broader view of things" (p. 8). The goal of the rhetorical criticism within this study is to identify the rhetorical visions found within the dramatistic messages communicated by and about unmarried mothers. Bormann (1972) indicates that the evidence should come from audio and video tapes, manuscripts, participant recollections, and direct observations. Shields (1981a) lists similar sources of rhetorical artifacts, such as literature searches, personal interviews, and focus group interviews. The critic looks for evidence that these fantasies are shared, searching for "similar dramatizing material such as word play, narratives, figures of speech, and analogies" which crop up in a variety of messages in different contexts (Bormann et al., 1984, p. 289). Essentially, the search for shared messages continues until the dramas begin repeating themselves and no new fantasy themes, types, or symbolic cues are found among the rhetoric available to the audience. The critic then attempts to describe and interpret the shared consciousness of the community based upon the recurring patterns of dramatic imagery found within their discourse.

Once the rhetorical critic has completed their analysis, they may then wear the cap of the social scientist and assess their interpretations against the perceptions of the rhetorical community being analyzed. This is done using Q-methodology; a form of factor analysis that correlates people based upon their similar sets of responses to perceived stimuli. It is a sophisticated form of rank ordering which clusters individuals based upon their own self-referent and operant interpretation of the rhetorical artifacts. As described by Brown (1980):

If two persons are like-minded on a topic their Q-sorts will be similar and they will both end up on the same factor. Hence, we do not classify them: they classify themselves on their own terms . . . (p. 208).

The end result is a typology of differential rhetorical visions that reflect the self-perceptions of the audience being studied. Unlike typical rhetorical analysis, which is not generalizable, the findings from a Q sort offer a degree of external validity. The visions identified by the Q sort do not necessarily mirror the structured visions identified by the rhetorical analysis. Rather, they demonstrate the extent to which the audience accepts, rejects, or is neutral to the rhetorical imagery. Once

those visions from the Q sort have been identified; the critic once again employs humanistic analysis to fully interpret the social consciousness of the collective.

As mentioned, no current communicative research has been done on the subject of unmarried mothers, though both fantasy theme analysis and fantasy theme analysis/Q-methodology studies exist which examine a variety of rhetorical communities and situations. The diversity of topic areas addressed using fantasy theme analysis attests to the flexibility of the methodology, and its sensitivity in identifying and interpreting symbolic realities. Bormann (1972) originally analyzed the Puritan rhetorical vision. Other studies have interpreted the visions of such diverse groups and individuals as the Disciples of Christ (Henley, 1975), the American Communist Party (Ilkka, 1977), and Malcolm X (Shields, 1981b). Many of the studies which employ fantasy theme analysis focus on images in politics. Topics of coverage have included the Eagleton Affair (Bormann, 1973), McGovern's image (Bantz, 1975), Watergate (Porter, 1976), the Reagan inauguration and Iranian hostage release (Bormann, 1982b), and the 1984 Reagan mandate (Aden, 1986). Studies of abstract political and social dramas are evidenced by Cragan's (1972, 1981) interpretations of the Cold War rhetoric, and Bormann's (1985) analysis of the rhetorical visions that shaped our culture, including the Puritan and Evangelical rhetorical styles, the rhetoric of the anti-slavery movement, and the vision of Abraham Lincoln.

The review of literature also reveals that fantasy theme analysis/Q-methodology are gaining in popularity as a symbolic assessment tool. Political imagery has been the focus of many of these studies. Areas of research include the public's image of Jimmy Carter (Rarick et al., 1977), response to political cartoons (Bormann et al., 1978), the 1980 response to Reagan, Carter, and Anderson (Bormann et al., 1984), and the 1984 Minnesota Senate race (Bormann et al., 1985). More relevant to this study, Q-methodology has been used to discover the rhetorical visions of several diverse collectives, including fire fighters (Shields, 1974), obese women (Madden, 1982), and law professors, students, and practicing lawyers (McFarland, 1983). Similar to this project, these latter studies each identified a typology of rhetorical visions that constituted the base of social reality for the members of the collective being studied.

Method

Procedure for Fantasy Theme Analysis

Evidence for the rhetorical criticism was gathered from searches of both academic and popular literature resources. Most useful were the variety of self-help and psychology manuals published over the past 25 years. These were available in the public libraries, public bookstores, and through support groups. Dramas were also found in such popular periodicals as *Ebony*, *Glamour*, *Ladies Home Journal*, *McCall's*, *Ms.*, *New York*, *New York Times*, *Psychology Today*, *Saturday Review*, *Seventeen*, *Time*, and *USA Today*. Non-print media was also examined for dramatic scenarios. Included were the 1976 film "I Want to Keep My Baby" (Lee & Thorpe: CBS Television Workshop Production), and a videotape produced in 1985 by the Children's Home Society. Information was also gathered through personal and focus group interviews. Interviews were held with counselors, state department workers, single parent researchers, and unmarried mothers. All interviews were conducted in an open-ended manner, with interviewees being asked to provide examples of issues that were pertinent to the unmarried mother's picture of herself. Interviewees were

asked to elaborate and support their ideas with actual or hypothetical examples. The interviews were ended when the images being presented became redundant, and no new scenarios could be elicited.

Once the evidence was collected, the manifest content of the messages was analyzed for patterns of characterizations, dramatic situations and actions, and settings. The criteria for identification and selection of fantasy themes, types, and cues is similar to that used by Rarick, Duncan, Lee, and Porter (1977), who used the criteria of: frequency of appearance of the image, range of media in which the themes appeared, and dramatic content of the themes. Dramatic content was the overriding criterion in the initial analysis. Then, once the review of scenarios was complete, the criteria of frequency and range came into play. Only those images that occurred at least three times and in at least two independent sources were included in the final rhetorical analysis and subsequently transferred to the Q-sort in the next step.

In order to provide a structure for the rhetorical analysis that would be amenable to Q-methodology, the interpretation of the dramas was housed within a "visions x issues" framework. The visions plane refers to the overriding differential dimensions that separate and make distinct the composite dramas. The distinct visions identified in the discourse are composed of nine differential issues (i.e. the issues plane) that represent the recurring fantasy themes, types, and symbolic cues. Cragan and Shields (1981) state that most people attach themselves to one of three major visions, so the identification of that number is sufficient for the rhetorical analysis. This author felt that deciding a priori to search for three major visions would be unnecessarily limiting. As such, no pre-imposed framework for assessing the visions plane was used; the findings emerged from the data. As the reader will note, this study did identify three major visions. While this offers support for the Cragan and Shields claim, using the "three competing visions" rule-of-thumb when beginning the rhetorical analysis is not recommended.

Procedure for Q-Methodology

The first step in using Q-methodology is to create a Q-sort card deck whose items encompass the imagery uncovered in the fantasy theme analysis. The three visions x nine issues matrix developed above constituted the framework for the Q-sort. The dramas in each of the twenty-seven cells were replicated onto two cards each for inter-item reliability. Thus, a deck of 54 cards was produced. Each card presented a drama (50 to 60 words in length) in which the protagonist of the story was an unmarried mother. The deck was pretested for readability by eight adolescents, and the instructions were pretested on a support group for unmarried mothers. Fifteen coders (12 speech communication graduate assistants, 2 single mothers, 1 counselor) read through and sorted the deck for face validity. Confidence can be placed on the validity of the deck as evidenced by the high level of inter-rater agreement: 100% agreement—42 cards (78%); 93% agreement—5 cards (9%); 87% agreement—7 cards (13%).

Subjects

Sixty-four unmarried mothers from a metropolitan area participated in the study. Forty-eight of the subjects were contacted through support and educational programs designed for unmarried mothers, while sixteen subjects were contacted through word of mouth and newspaper advertisements. Since Q-methodology is a small sample

statistic, the subjects were divided into matched samples of 32 members each. The samples were matched on the demographic characteristics of age, ethnic background, and group (or no group) affiliation. The subjects sorted the deck of 54 cards into a "most like me—least like me" continuum composed of nine columns. The number of cards within each column was as follows: 2-4-6-9-12-9-6-4-2, thus forming a pyramid shape and insuring that the most salient cards were fully discriminated between. The average length of time for each Q-sort was 40 minutes.

Data Analysis

Analysis of the data was done using VanTubergan's QUANAL program. The program first computes a person-person correlation matrix, then extracts the principal components which indicate factors, or person types. The WRAP (Weighted Rotational Analytic Procedure) computes a z-score for every item within the factor/type, then lists each type in a descending order of z-scores. The researcher can visualize, in order, the most highly accepted and strongly rejected items in each type identified. Items (dramas on the cards) with a z-score above +1.00 and below -1.00 were those used to identify the persona of the Q-types. Once the Q-typology is identified, it is then reinterpreted in accordance with the rhetorical methodology.

Results

Fantasy Theme Analysis

As mentioned earlier, a three vision x nine issue matrix was identified. The three visions were labeled The Down and Out Vision, The Making the Best Vision, and The Yummie Vision. The composite dramas of the three visions were created from differential fantasy themes, types, and symbolic cues along the following nine issues: Parents, Birthfather, Society, Relationship with Child, Disclosure, New Men, Loneliness, Control, and the Future. Space here does not permit explication of the entire analysis (see Endres, 1986, 1988 for full analysis). A truncated version of the three visions, including example fantasy themes, will be provided in the descriptions below.

The Down and Out Vision

This mother is young; teens to early twenties. In over 90% of the cases her pregnancy was accidental. Those that were purposeful result from unrealistic expectations (e.g. get out of a bad situation, make boyfriend love me) that are detached from the responsibilities of motherhood. The pregnancy is a bad situation, and the mother of this vision doesn't see anyway out or up. She feels negative about herself and victimized by major figures in her life. Primary impact is from her family, who are nonsupportive. Dad is angry and disappointed. Mother is a central figure. There is a wedge between mother and daughter, almost hatred. Strong feelings exist for the birthfather. Mostly she feels angry, hurt, and "screwed over." There are also moments of "White Knight Syndrome," where she feels the birthfather will come around and love them and take care of them. She feels put down by society, as if she should wear the scarlet letter A. Her image of herself reflects a societal image that says she is bad and a sinner. She has an unrealistic "baby doll" fantasy about her child. Her baby is her private property; an all-loving doll that will love her more than anyone ever has.

Because of her bad feelings about her situation, she denies her motherhood status to new people. She claims the baby isn't hers, or that she is married or divorced. Or she may choose the militant form of self-presentation, presenting her status with hostility and bitterness. New men are not to be trusted. One guy hurt her, they probably all will. And if they know she's a single parent, they will think she is loose and easy. She may feel she needs to act easy to get attention. Her life is very lonely. Her child has cut her off from friends, family, and social life. She is a victim; everything always happens to her. She can not visualize the future. She feels destined to stay where she is; this is all she will ever be. Any positive visualization is vague and unrealistic, assuming her life will be fine, without knowing how or why.

The following images exemplify several of the fantasy themes that composed the vision outlined above. For the mother who adheres to the Down and Out vision, the world is a lonely place. In the 1985 Children's Home Society videotape, one young mother sketches the following bleak scenario about her life with her daughter:

When she took her first step, and when she said her first word, and I would go to bed and I would say to myself, "Oh, wasn't that just great?" And there's still just a little bit of emptiness when you roll over, and you kinda wish that somebody was there that you could say, "Did you see that?" And—there isn't anybody there.

The sanctioning agent for the Down and Out mother is a force outside her own control, exemplified in a fantasy theme from 19 year old Laura:

I sure don't believe in any god anymore, else how could he let so many things happen to me? I've got married friends who want a baby and can't have one. If there was any right in the world they would be having this baby, not me. Everything I don't want I get, but if I really want something it never comes (Vincent, 1961, p. 49).

The Making the Best Vision

This mother is also the young mother who becomes pregnant accidentally. The pregnancy is a bad situation, but with the support of others (and often with the passage of time) she is striving to make the best of a bad situation. A positive relationship with her family is a great boon. Dad was disappointed, but also supportive. Again, the mother is a central figure. Here, the relationship has improved to a level of great love, and mutual respect and understanding. While there may have been some anger at the birthfather, time has healed that wound. The mother is ready to get on with her life, and she is not going to wait around for the birthfather to show up. She sees some social stigma and criticism going on, but has learned to brush it off. She feels unwed mothers are not treated as bad as in the "old days," and she knows there is support out there to be found. Her child is not a doll, but a very real human with a lot of needs. She has learned more about giving love and accepting responsibility; providing a more realistic view of the mother/child relationship. How she presents herself in public is situational. If people need to know, she will discuss and not deny her status. If her motherhood is irrelevant and unnecessary information, she may go along with a "story" for convenience's sake. She does not blame the action of the birthfather on all men, and is ready to begin meeting and dating new people. She would like these new relationships to be more on her terms than in the past. She

understands that life as a single parent can be lonely, so she strives to combat that by seeking out other single moms and support groups. This may be the first time she has ever felt control of her life. Her new found sense of responsibility leaves little time to feel victimized. She is getting her act together. There is a strong attempt to visualize the future. She knows that plans need to be made to provide a good life for her and her child.

Eighteen year old Susan exemplifies a character fantasy theme as she describes her relationship with her mother:

Having my baby really brought me close to my own mother. I understand much better now—everything she went through with my brother and me. She supports me with a lot of love and that's very good for my baby, too (Witt & Michael, 1982, p. 125).

For the Making the Best mother, her communicative dramas about the future demonstrate a new found sense of responsibility, as illustrated by sixteen year old Joyce:

Getting pregnant changed my life. I never thought about the future. I just figured there'd always be someone to take care of me if something went wrong. Now I know I've got to take care of myself. I guess that's part of becoming an adult (Witt & Michael, 1982, p. 151).

• The Yummie Vision

This is the Young, Upwardly Mobile Mother. She is generally in her late 20's to mid-30's. She is educated, and usually well established in a career. Her decision to have a child out of wedlock was a conscious one. She wanted a family, and decided she was able to raise a child alone. Since she is on her own, there is little parent/daughter conflict with her own family. While her parents may be disappointed with her decision, they end up being supportive. No parent is primary. What she expects from them is respect, and for her child to be treated as grandchildren from wedded siblings would be. There is little emotional attachment to the birthfather. She was tired of waiting for Prince Charming/Mr. Right, so she decided to have a child but not a husband. Any social stigmatization is viewed as outdated. This is a new era of parenthood, and she is a new breed of single parent; one that is better than a bad marriage or a divorce. Most people support her. Those that do not understand are the ones with the problem, not her. Her child is not a doll from whom she expects love. Rather, it is a baby to whom she can give her abundant love. She felt emotionally secure and knew that she had enough love to give before she decided to become pregnant. Her self-presentation consists of an honest, happy, and confident style. She knows that if people she meets sense how positive she feels about her status, then they will feel positive, too. There is no immorality in being an unwed mother as long as you are a responsible and caring parent. There is no hostility to new men/dating partners, but there is also little feeling of need for them. Nice men are okay if she has the time, but her life with her child is more important than going out on a boring date. While she may have the sense of loneliness that all mothers feel, her lifestyle does not permit feelings of isolation. She is always on the move; involved at work or other social activities. When at home, her child is the social glue that brings family and friends in. More than anything, she feels in control of her life. These were her decisions all the way, and even if things go wrong, she will not feel the victim. Her

decisions were made with a keen sense of the future. She knew how to look ahead to see if she could offer a good life to her child. She has done a costs/benefits analysis of her life to determine that she is ready for motherhood.

The Yummie vision is composed of independent and upbeat fantasy themes, types, and cues. The issue of society's viewpoint is expressed in a fantasy theme by the mother of a one year old child:

Look, this isn't a "Father Knows Best" world anymore. If you live in the city, there are a lot of single parents. Granted, most kids have a father they see on occasion, but a hell of a lot of kids get by with Mom only. And five years from now there will be more kids who have unmarried mothers. There are many things a kid has to deal with, but I think the social stigma about marital status will be the least of my son's problems (Merritt & Steiner, 1984, p. 147).

A similar tone is expressed by Lee (1982), as she portrays her relationship with her child in the following dramatization:

I didn't want to have a child because I was bored with my life, or because I was trying to hold together a shaky marriage, or because my mother wanted to be a grandmother. I didn't want to have a child as a way of retreating from my career, or because I thought it was every woman's destiny to be a mother. I wanted a child not because I wanted to get something, but because I wanted to give (p. 249).

Q-Methodology

Briefly, the sorting responses of two matched samples were analyzed using the QUANAL program. Of the 32 subjects in Sample A, 31 typed into one of four distinct factors. One subject produced a fifth factor. The five factor solution accounted for 57.26% of the total variance. Cumulative total and within solution variance are shown in Table 1. The correlations between the types ranged from $-.086$ to $.649$. While

TABLE 1 Sample A Variance

	Type 1	Type 2	Type 3	Type 4	Type 5
Cumulative % total variance	.3864	.4479	.4951	.5358	.5726
Cumulative % of variance w/in solution	.6748	.7821	.8646	.9356	1.000

there appears to be some overlap between the types, the WRAP phase of QUANAL indicated that specific issues clearly differentiated the factors. Types 1 through 4 were quite distinct. Type 5 represented the scores of one individual, and accounted for only 3.68% of the total variance. The vision was quite chaotic, accepting and rejecting items from all three rhetorical categories. This type was found to have no rhetorical significance or heuristic value, and was dropped from the analysis.

As with Sample A, 31 of the 32 subjects in Sample B typed into one of four distinct factors, and one subject produced a fifth factor. The five factor solution accounted for 59.02% of the total variance. Table 2 reports the cumulative total and within solution variance. Correlations between the types ranged from $-.018$ to $.750$. Again, while some overlap exists, the visions are appropriately distinct. Sample B Type 5 was again a one subject type, and accounted for only 3.04% of the total variance. Unlike Sample

TABLE 2. Sample B Variance

	Type 1	Type 2	Type 3	Type 4	Type 5
Cumulative % total variance	.4000	.4856	.5276	.5598	.5902
Cumulative % of variance w/in solution	.6778	.8227	.8939	.9485	1.000

A's chaotic fifth factor, the vision here is quite strong and consistent (primarily a Down and Out Vision). It was the investigator's belief that this vision was rhetorically worthy of analysis and could provide heuristic insight for further analysis.

Previous studies of this kind (Madden, 1982; McFarland, 1983) have gone beyond the interpretation of Q-types identified in their samples, and have searched for higher order rhetorical visions that are common to all sets of subjects. Such a comparison was made for this study, to identify reliable and stable visions that exist between Samples A and B. The term "transcendent types" will be used to describe the type of persona that emerged from this comparison. The dramatic content of the transcendent types is comprised of the Q deck items that are matched between one type from Sample A and one type from Sample B. Four maximally optimal and consistent transcendent types emerged from the comparison. No other within or between sample comparisons produced such consistent transcendent types. To avoid confusion with the alphabetic and numeric labels used for the samples and Q types, the transcendent types will be identified by the Greek letters Alpha through Delta. Unlike the Q types, which are ordered from strongest to weakest by the amount of variance accounted for, the transcendent types are ordered from strongest to weakest by the total number of shared dramas and clarity of the overall vision. Interpretation of the transcendent types is provided below.

Transcendent Type Alpha

This type emerged from the combination of Sample A Type 2 ($n = 8$) and Sample B Type 4 ($n = 7$). There are fifteen shared dramas in this vision. There is a strong acceptance of Yummie-oriented dramas, and strong rejection of Down and Out imagery. The Alpha mother is the epitome of the young, upwardly mobile mother. She sees nothing wrong with her decision to have and raise a child out of wedlock. She knew she was ready to have a child, and will never see herself as a victim. Her sense of the future is clear, and her plans do not include the birthfather. She does not foresee being lonely, and she is not afraid to present her motherhood status to the world.

Rhetorically, the core fantasy type of the Alpha vision is a variation of the American Dream. The fantasy type places the locus of control clearly in the protagonist who desires a laudable goal and works hard to achieve success. Surrounding the core fantasy type are a series of dramas in which the protagonist makes independent decisions, works out her own destiny, and can take pride in her accomplishments. The setting of the Alpha vision is a modern culture in which old taboos about unwed mothers are losing their force. Inherent to the dramas is the sense that the Alpha mother is the cornerstone to a new breed of motherhood, one who can maintain both a career and a family.

The predominant emotional evocations of the vision include pride in accomplishment, hope for the future, love for the child, and irritation with those who would

through bigotry or lack of information stand in her way. She reflects a "righteous" attitude as described by Cragan and Shields (1981). She feels a sense of community with other mothers like her, which leads to a feeling of group prestige that is elite in nature.

In essence, the Alpha transcendent type is a coping social reality. This young, upwardly mobile mother is not preoccupied with the negative viewpoints of society or the mechanics of survival. The former is inconsequential to her, and the latter is second nature. The woman who shares in the Alpha vision should be open to communication that appeals to her desire for economic security, successful family life, problem-solving ability, and those that present her as the master of her own fate.

Transcendent Types Beta Through Delta

The remaining three transcendent types were essentially statistically different versions of visions that were largely composed of dramas from the Making the Best rhetoric. What follows is a brief description of the individual visions and the composite dramas that compose them, and a rhetorical interpretation of the similarities and differences of the three transcendent types.

Transcendent type Beta emerged from Sample A Type 3 ($n = 15$) and Sample B Type 2 ($n = 7$). Thirteen scenarios comprise the vision. The primarily accepted items are Making the Best, followed closely by Yummie scenarios. All rejected dramas are from the Down and Out dimension. The Beta mother realizes she made a mistake, but she is not going to let it ruin her life. She has learned a lot from the experience. She sees this as an opportunity to get out and meet new people and start dating new men. She knows that having a child is going to be a lot of work, but she feels that, between her positive attitude and a generally supportive society, she will prevail.

Transcendent type Gamma developed from the comparison of Sample A Type 4 ($n = 4$) and Sample B Type 1 ($n = 15$). In this eight card vision, Making the Best items and one Yummie scenario are accepted. The rejected items are split between the Yummie and Down and Out dramas. The Gamma mother didn't plan on becoming pregnant, but the situation has helped her to grow up. She feels more responsible, and has a new orientation toward the future. She knows she can find other mothers to share her experience with, and she is becoming more ready to start dating new men. All in all, she feels lucky with the positive way in which things have turned out.

Transcendent type Delta was identified from the comparison of Sample A Type 1 ($n = 4$) and Sample B Type 3 ($n = 2$). Of the eight cards that compose the Delta vision, the accepted items are split between the Making the Best and Yummie dramas, and with the exception of one Making the Best item, all rejected dramas are Down and Out. The Delta mother has come a long way since having her baby. It hasn't been easy, and she misses her freedom, but she knows she has to plan ahead and be responsible if she is to survive. Her parents are very important to her, and it is their support that provides her primary comfort and motivation. She has no desire to see the birthfather. She wants to be happy as a single mother, and wants other people to be happy for her.

When doing a rhetorical comparison between these three transcendent types, it is clear that the Beta vision is the most clearly delineated. The core fantasy type of the Beta through Delta visions reflects the American drama of "picking oneself up by the bootstraps." While the initial sanctioning agent may have been fate or chance, there

has been a shift in the locus of control as it moves more and more into the hands of the protagonist. Similar to the rhetorical visions of fundamentalist Christians, the Beta, Gamma, and Delta mothers have been "born again." Though they have not necessarily entered into a new communion with Christ, they have moved into a new phase of their lives which allows them to leave their past sins and problems behind, and forge ahead into a life filled with new meanings and commitment. Like so many born-again Christians, the motivation for her transformation was an externally provoked personal crisis.

The setting has changed from an apathetic and uninvolved society to a culture that is friendly and supportive. Past scenes of social condemnation and ostracism have fallen by the wayside to make room for scenes of nurturance and aid.

Within the Beta vision the combination of newfound locus of control and sense of the future evoke emotions comparable to those found among the adherents of the Alpha vision. The primary motivations for the Beta mother that stem from this are a desire to plan for the future, to accept more responsibility, and to present herself in a positive manner to others. The Gamma and Delta visions reflect similar emotions and motivations, though each contains particular dramatizations that change the complexion of the respective visions. The emotional evocations of the Gamma mother imply a sense of relief that she can now alleviate the loneliness in her life, and seek out support groups and new dating partners. The Delta mother has strong emotional ties to her child and to her parents. She is motivated to give more love to her child than she receives from it, and to behave in a way that is pleasing to her mother and father.

An appropriate descriptor, provided by Cragan and Shields (1981), of the Beta through Delta types is that of the "pragmatic" rhetorical vision. The social reality of these mothers leads to behaviors that are practical and future oriented. The Beta, Gamma, and Delta mothers are most amenable to that communication which is encouraging rather than condemning, that applauds her newfound abilities, and that points her in the direction of her future.

Transcendent Type Epsilon

Though not having a match in Sample A, the individual in Sample B Type 5 portrayed such a symbolically important vision that this author felt it deserved both description and rhetorical analysis at this stage. Of the twelve accepted dramas, ten are from the Down and Out rhetoric. In consistent form, three Making the Best and nine Yummie scenarios are rejected. The Epsilon woman feels bitter and ashamed, mostly because her parents have made her feel guilty. She is angry at the birthfather, and feels cut off and condemned by society. She experiences great loneliness, and feels she has no control over her life. Her only saving grace appears to be her child, who has helped her to grow up and has gotten her to think about her future.

From the standpoint of the rhetorical critic, the victimization fantasy type is the central drama for the Epsilon mother. She is powerless in a male-dominated and oppressive world. The sanctioning agent of the dramas is clearly an external force or forces which justify the destructive powers of the antagonists, i.e. society, her parents, and the birthfather. The setting is a culture that has not changed its traditional and moralistic condemnation of out of wedlock motherhood.

The predominant emotions evoked are feelings of victimization, anger, guilt, shame, and hatred. Beneath it all, however, shines affection for her child and a defiant rejection of the dismal future dramas traditionally imposed by an antagonistic society.

She is highly motivated to conceal her status. Her feelings of mistrust and anger motivate her to avoid contact with her parents and with new men, in the event they would want to hurt or ridicule her.

On balance, the Epsilon vision is essentially negative in nature. Save the uncharacteristic realistic perspective on her child and their future, the Epsilon mother truly epitomizes the Down and Out rhetorical vision found in the fantasy theme analysis. For effective communication leading to productive sharing, the skilled communicator may wish to work within the "you and me against the world" fantasy type she has developed with her child. Once inside the boundary, further sharing may be feasible.

Discussion

As mentioned previously in this essay, the results of a Q-sort, which are based on an analysis of the audience, need not directly mirror the composite dramas of the rhetorical analysis, which is based on the messages available to that audience. Though there was a great amount of overlap between the results of the fantasy theme analysis and the Q-sort, the differences indicate that a rhetorical community is active and responds to dramatizations in the messages by sharing them, rejecting them, or being apathetic to them. The perspective of a dynamic and interactive population indicates that rhetorical artifacts which appear clear cut and consistent may be only partially accepted by audience members. Keeping this in mind, this study provides a good deal of insight for communicative implications for unmarried mothers, professional counselors, and communication researchers.

For the unmarried mother, this study demonstrates that the world need not be a lonely and chaotic place. Communication plays a key role in the development of the unwed mother's image of her self. Take for example the Epsilon mother from Sample B. She felt alone and isolated. It is not surprising that she found no "match" among the remaining 63 subjects; women who all *shared* rhetorical visions with others. The assumption can be made that dramatizing with others does indeed promote facilitative self-images and enhanced coping strategies. This assumption is supported by both the amount of overlap and the degree of discrepancy between the visions, particularly visions Beta, Gamma, and Delta. The correlations between the types point to a solid common ground; items and issues that the unwed mother shares to some degree or another with her peers. Beyond that, the results indicate she can develop a unique rapport with women who share more specific and individualized dramas.

Because her self-image is so heavily influenced by her communication patterns, and because communication is so dynamic, the implication is that the development of an unwed mother's persona is an ongoing process. Unlike the static messages in the rhetorical artifacts, the social reality of the unwed mother is both flexible and allows transitions. For example, the Making the Best mother who admits she made a mistake when she got pregnant still has the opportunity to disclose her motherhood status with all the pride of a Yummie proponent.

Studies of this type may also benefit professionals and counselors. In Wilkinson's (1980) discussion of counseling approaches for minority women, she points to "a need to train and retrain therapists in such a way that they will become cognizant of the sociocultural factors influencing their *interactions with and judgements of* the emotional difficulties encountered by minority females who become their clients" (p.

296). In a sense, the unmarried mother can be defined as a minority woman, and this study could help provide the counselor with insight into those sociocultural factors.

The identification of different social realities shared by the subjects not only gives the counselor a starting point for therapeutic intervention, it also reveals the communicative shortcomings of two inappropriate strategies: (1) communicating with all unwed mothers as if they were all members of the same audience, or (2) treating all unwed mothers as though they were entirely idiosyncratic. One could imagine how nonproductive a counseling session would be if the therapist or counselor thought every woman viewed her experience from a Yummie perspective, and one of her clients largely adhered to Down and Out fantasies. Studies have shown that therapists bring their personal sex-role values to a counseling session, and that sex-role discrepant behaviors are judged as more maladjusted (Sherman, 1980, p. 60). An understanding of the rhetorical visions adhered to by a client can help a counselor work within the mother's self-perception, rather than the biased pre-perception of the counselor.

Of course, the rhetorical typology found within this study is not meant to be an exhaustive descriptor of the potential types, but it does provide a solid conceptual base from which to begin. And, as this study has demonstrated, the Q sort can be used to develop a rhetorical image of a single individual.

Finally, this study sets the stage for a variety of research projects, both topic-related and methodological, for the field of speech-communication. Concerning the topic of unmarried mothers, there are several possible extensions to this study. The most logical step would be the replication of the Q-sort using different sets of subjects. While the Q-types identified within the study would have limited external validity, comparisons could be continually made across Q-types to identify higher-order transcendent types that are consistent across a variety of sample populations. There may exist what Bormann (1985) calls "life-style rhetorical visions;" visions that are "so all-encompassing and impelling that they permeate an individual's social reality in all aspects of living (p. 8)." If such a consistent typology can be identified with a larger number of subjects, the next step would be to create a dramatic based questionnaire that could be used on large populations. Questionnaire items would be developed from those scenarios that are most salient to, and discriminating between, the different visions. Such an instrument would have great potential as a diagnostic tool for professionals as they could, in a short amount of time, develop a basic assessment of what issues are relevant to their client, and what composite dramas represent their self-image.

Further replications of the Q-sort could also be executed with the subjects being asked to sort the deck under various conditions of instruction. As Shields (1974) did with the St. Paul fire fighters, comparisons could be made between an unwed mother's self and projected personae. She could also be asked to sort the deck in a manner that would depict her image of a certain genre of mother, for example "the welfare mother," "the supermom," "the unwed mother of the future," and so on. Subjects who are not unwed mothers, such as parents, counselors, dating partners, and members of the general public, could also be asked to sort the deck. These viewpoints would provide more insight into the symbolic world of the unmarried mother.

A final topic-related approach would be to replicate this study over time. As evidenced by the rhetorical analysis (particularly in the Making the Best dramas), the images and dramas about unwed mothers are quite different than they were two

decades ago. The pregnant adolescent of the past was an outcast who was hidden away, and the rare older and elective mother was defined as a true social deviant. It would be interesting to discover what viewpoints exist twenty years from the time of this original study.

This project also raises an interesting question about the study of group dramatization and the concept of indoctrination, or consciousness-raising of newcomers into the group. Most clubs, organizations, fraternal groups, and the like, work to indoctrinate new members by espousing the values of participation in their collective. They engage in founding fantasies about their inception, and dramatize about the group's prestige to make it appear more inviting. It would be interesting to compare and contrast the rhetorical strategies with the ones used by support groups for pregnant teens, who do no such proselytizing. The same could be said of other group types whose members are there due to unfortunate circumstances (e.g. support groups for alcoholics, cancer victims, sudden infant death families). The uniqueness of the consciousness-raising rhetoric for these groups seems worthy of future study.

Lastly, this study also points to a new potential for Q-methodology in our field. Both published and unpublished studies in our ranks have shown that Q-sorts can be used to identify the symbolic reality of a variety of group types. With the exception of Madden's (1982) study of obese women, little has been done to examine personal and/or health related topics with the goal of diagnosis and intervention. With our field's increasing interest in health communication and family communication, a research method is needed that provides insight into the conceptual framework of its subjects. As demonstrated in this study, Q-methodology has the potential to provide such data. At an immediate and applicable level, the Q-deck from this study has already been implemented as an icebreaker and discussion tool for several unmarried mother support groups.

As the number of unmarried mothers continues to increase, the importance of consistent social realities and communicative strategies for the population will increase as well. This study has indicated that fantasy theme analysis can be used to assess the communicative dramas, and Q-methodology allows audience validation and expansion of the rhetorical images, and provides a coherent baseline from which to interpret the unmarried mother's experiences.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Aden, R.C. (1986). Fantasy themes and rhetorical visions in the 1984 Presidential campaign: Explaining the Reagan mandate. *Speaker and Gavel*, 23(3), 87-94.
- Bantz, C.R. (1975). Television news: Reality and research. *Western States Speech Journal*, 123, 123-130.
- Bormann, E.G. (1972). Fantasy and rhetorical vision: The rhetorical criticism of social reality. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, 58(4), 396-407.
- Bormann, E.G. (1973). The Eagleton Affair: A fantasy theme analysis. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, 59, 143-159.
- Bormann, E.G. (1980). *Communication Theory*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.
- Bormann, E.G. (1982a). Fantasy and rhetorical vision: Ten years later. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, 68, 288-305.
- Bormann, E.G. (1982b). A fantasy theme analysis of the television coverage of the hostage release and the Reagan inaugural. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, 68, 133-145.
- Bormann, E.G. (1985). *The Force of Fantasy: Restoring the American Dream*. Carbondale, IL: Southern Illinois University Press.
- Bormann, E.G., Koester, J., & Bennett, J. (1978). Political cartoons and salient rhetorical fantasies: An empirical analysis of the '76 Presidential campaign. *Communication Monographs*, 45, 317-329.

- Bormann, E.G., Kroll, B.S., Watters, K., & McFarland, D. (1984). Rhetorical visions of committed voters: Fantasy theme analysis of a large sample survey. *Critical Studies in Mass Communication*, 1, 287-310.
- Bormann, E.G., Olson, G., Percy, M.B., & Tremaine, R. (1985). A fantasy theme analysis of the Grove-Boschwitz Senatorial campaign in the Minnesota state election of 1984. *The Speech Association of Minnesota Journal*, 12, 39-60.
- Brown, S.R. (1980). *Political Subjectivity: Applications of Q-Methodology in Political Science*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- CHYP: Children's Home Young Parents groups. (1985). (Videotape). Children's Home Society of Minnesota.
- Cragan, J.F. (1972). The Cold War Rhetorical Visions 1946-1972. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Speech Communication Department, University of Minnesota.
- Cragan, J.F. (1981). The origins and nature of the Cold War rhetorical vision 1946-1972: A partial history. In Cragan and Shields (Ed.), *Applied Communication Research: A Dramatistic Approach*. Prospect Heights, IL: Waveland Press, Inc.
- Cragan, J.F., & Shields, D.C. (1981). Uses of Bormann's rhetorical theory in applied communication research. In Cragan and Shields (Ed.), *Applied Communication Research: A Dramatistic Approach*. Prospect Heights, IL: Waveland Press, Inc.
- Endres, T.G. (1986). A Dramatistic Analysis of Unmarried Mothers: Toward A Typology of Rhetorical Visions. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Speech Communication Department, University of Minnesota.
- Endres, T.G. (1988). *A Dramatistic Analysis of the Rhetoric Produced By and About Unmarried Mothers*. Paper presented at the annual convention of the Speech Communication Association, New Orleans.
- Golden, J. L., Berquist, G. F., & Coleman, W. E. (1983). *The Rhetoric of Western Thought*, 3rd ed. Dubuque, IA: Kendall/Hunt Publishing Company.
- Hansen, C. (1980). *Your Choice: A Young Woman's Guide to Making Decisions About Unmarried Pregnancy*. New York: Avon Books.
- Henley, C.W. (1975). Rhetorical vision and the persuasion of a historical movement: The Disciples of Christ in Nineteenth century American culture. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, 61, 250-264.
- Ilkka, R.J. (1977). Rhetorical dramatization in the development of American Communism. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, 63, 413-427.
- Klein, C. (1973). *The Single Parent Experience*. New York: Walker and Company.
- Lee, J. (Producer) & Thorpe, J. (Director). (1976). I Want to Keep My Baby. (Film). CBS Television Workshop Production.
- Lee, L. (1982, November). My fatherless baby. *Glamour*. 248-249, 281-283.
- Madden, M.J. (1982). The Symbolic World of Obesity: A Study of the Rhetorical Visions of Obese Women. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Speech Communication Department, University of Minnesota.
- McFarland, D. D. (1983). Self-images of Law Professors: Rethinking Legal Education. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Speech Communication Department, University of Minnesota.
- Merritt, S. & Steiner, L. (1984). *And Baby Makes Two: Motherhood Without Marriage*. New York: Franklin Watts.
- Morrisroe, P. (1983, June 6). Mommy only: The rise of the Middle-class unwed mother. *New York*, 23-29.
- Oettinger, K. B., & Mooney, E. C. (1979). *Not My Daughter: Facing Up To Adolescent Pregnancy*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, Inc.
- Porter, L.W. (1976). The White House transcripts: Group fantasy events concerning the mass media. *Central States Speech Journal*, 27, 272-279.
- Rarick, D.L., Duncan, M.B., Lee, D.G., & Porter, L.W. (1977) The Carter Persona: An empirical analysis of the rhetorical visions of campaign '76. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, 63, 258-273.
- Sherman, J.A. (1980). Therapist attitudes and sex role stereotyping. In Brodsky and Hare-Mustin (Ed), *Women and Psychotherapy*. New York: The Guilford Press.
- Shields, D.C. (1974). The Fire Fighter's Dramatis Persona: A Study of Private, Projected and Public Character From the Perspective of Rhetorical Vision. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Speech Communication Department, University of Minnesota.

BOOK REVIEWS

The Territory of Language

Joyce Neu

Donald McQuade, *The Territory of Language*. Carbondale, IL: Southern Illinois University Press, 1987.

The Territory of Language is a revised and expanded version of the 1979 publication *Linguistics, Stylistics, and the Teaching of Composition*. We are fortunate to have this book back in print and in wider circulation as the majority of articles are important contributions to our understanding of the writing process. However, it is a pity that the second time around, more care wasn't taken with the organization and editing of the articles.

The book is divided into three parts—"mapping the territory," "exploring the language," and "teaching the connections." Many of the twenty five articles seem to fit into more than one of these parts (e.g., Bartholomae's article on the use of student errors in teaching writing could presumably fit as well in the "exploring the language" or "teaching the connections" category as it does in the "mapping the territory" part it is placed in; similarly, Kinneavy's article on the hermeneutic circle would perhaps be better suited to "mapping the territory" than it is to the "teaching the connections" section it is placed in).

Other articles seem misplaced: the article by Young (analysis of theme and development of a matrix to analyze theme) would fit more appropriately in the section "exploring the language;" Clifford's discussion of Berthoff's work, and DiYanni's review of Lanham's work—paralleling the article in "mapping the territory" by Bartholomae which reviews Shaughnessey's work, should also be in this section of the book.

Precisely because of this confusion about how decisions were made to place certain articles in one section and not another, it would have been helpful for the editor to have included a brief overview of each section, explaining how the articles in each section cohere and contribute to our understanding of each category. At the very least, the editor might have provided us with an introduction explaining the three divisions. As it is, these three categories appear to be artificial divisions into which the articles are somewhat arbitrarily divided.

There are further difficulties. It is depressing that a book on the writing process would contain so many flaws in the format and proofreading. This book provides us with no index, no references listed in alphabetical order either at the end of each article or compiled at the end of the book. References occur in the form of notes for each article in the back of the book. Even here, however, there is an inconsistency—the article by Witte, Daly and Cherry has its own references in alphabetical order at the end of the article. The use of notes rather than an alphabetical listing of references (either after each article or a compilation at the end of the book) does not permit us to get an overview of the sources drawn on, nor to refer back to the book to look up a reference.

At a more mechanical level, there are typographical errors throughout. Sometimes there are as many as three on a page (cf., pp. 145, 291). Williams' article contains a reference to asking "a visiting fireman from MIT about rules . . . that might explain good and bad writing" (p.186). One wonders since when MIT has had its own fire dept. and what secrets its firepeople know about good writing. Another slip-up

- Shields, D.C. (1981a). A dramatistic approach to applied communication research: Theory, methods, and applications. In Cragan and Shields (Ed.), *Applied Communication Research: A Dramatistic Approach*. Prospect Heights, IL: Waveland Press, Inc.
- Shields, D.C. (1981b). Malcom X's Black unity address: Espousing Middle-class fantasy themes as American as apple pie. In Cragan and Shields (Ed.), *Applied Communication Research: A Dramatistic Approach*. Prospect Heights, IL: Waveland Press, Inc.
- Van Tubergan, N. (n.d.). Q-analysis (QUANAL). (mimeo) Mass Communication Research Bureau, School of Journalism, University of Iowa.
- Vincent, C.E. (1961). *Unmarried Mothers*. New York: The Free Press of Glencoe.
- Wilkinson, D.Y. (1980). Minority women: Social-cultural issues. In Brodsky and Hare-Mustin (Ed.), *Women and Psychotherapy*. New York: The Guilford Press.
- Witt, R.L., & Michael, J.M. (1982). *Mom, I'm Pregnant*. New York: Stein and Day Publishers.