

What we discussed in class:

- Historical Background
 - John Locke, On Property
 - Does nature have any value in and of itself?
 - What puts the greatest part of value upon land?
 - René Descartes, the beast-machine theory
 - How do humans differ essentially from animals (brutes)?
 - By what tests ("two most certain tests") can one employ in order to know that animals are not really human?

What we will discuss next class:

- Historical Background (Thursday, 3:30pm)
 - John Stuart Mill, "Nature"
 - Does nature have any value in and of itself?
 - What puts the greatest part of value upon land?
 - Pope Francis, *Laudato Si'*
 - Does nature have any value in and of itself?
 - What puts the greatest part of value upon land?

Note on the outline

- larger type = discussed in class
- smaller type = not discussed or only mentioned in class

I. Introductions

- Introduce myself
- Introduce webpage]

Course

American Conservation Philosophy and Its Critique

- Structure
 - Historical background
 - American conservation philosophy & practice
 - Critique
- Test after each unit
 - short writing
 - in response to questions

Webpage

- questions/problems?

Student introductions

- name
- interest in this course

II. Historical Background

Modern Philosophy & the Rise of Reason

- Advent of rational control of nature, and of mankind

The modern scientific worldview: representatives

- Galileo Galilei (1564–1642)
- Francis Bacon (1561–1626) – British natural philosopher
- **René Descartes (1596-1650) – French mathematician and philosopher**
- **John Locke (1632-1704) – British political philosopher**
- Isaac Newton (1642 –1727, English)

II.A. Francis Bacon (1561-1626) – the new conception of knowledge: mastery of nature

- Important Writings
 - Novum Organum Scientiarum (1620)
 - New Organon (New Logic)
 - Instauratio Magna (The Great Instauration)
 - unpublished during his lifetime
- Statement of **Anthropocentric Worldview**
 - "the empire of man over things is founded on the arts and sciences alone, for nature is only to be commanded by obeying her"
- Bacon's metaphysical worldview (metaphysics - theory of real being)
 - materialist theory of reality
 - complete reduction of all events to matter and motion
- Bacon's Epistemology (theory of knowledge)
 - Emphasized the usefulness of science in the relief of man's situation
 - Advocated a strictly empirical method of experimentation by which to discern the causes of nature.
 - He was "one of the earliest modern writers to propose the complete reduction of all events to matter and motion."¹
 - the **demand for a "new organon"** or new tool of human knowledge that will befit the goals and aims of the newly developing natural sciences (philosophies).
 - Equated human power and knowledge
 - "human knowledge and power are really the same" (15 of 15. 9)
 - Not "possible for any power to loosen or burst the chain of causes, nor is nature overcome except by submission" (*Ibid.*)
 - **"the real and legitimate goal of the sciences is the endowment of human life with new inventions and riches"** (23 of 45, 27)
 - He mentions three such discoveries that have shaped the human condition *universally*
 - Printing (in literature)
 - Gunpowder (in warfare)
 - The Compass (in navigation)
 - Technological achievement such as these shows civilized man to be a god to men, i.e., the savage and barbarous

II.B. Locke, "On Property"

¹ Crombie, p. 290.

The Resource Conception of Nature and the Problem of the Value in/of Nature

Concept of value:

- **intrinsic value**
 - valuable in itself, for itself, not for something else
 - a human being has intrinsic value
 - I value happiness for its own sake not for the sake of something else
- **instrumental value**
 - value solely for something other than itself
 - a piece of chalk has value for the sake of writing, not in itself
 - I don't value the money for its own sake but rather for the sake of the things I can buy with it.

Most Important Writings

- *Two Treatises of Government* (1689)
- *An Essay Concerning Human Understanding* (1690)

The Argument

- The problem
 - "how any one should ever come to have property in any thing" (1/9)
- Argument
 - Two arguments, interwoven:
 - Reason
 - Revelation
 - reason & revelation → one universal monarch should have (any) property
 - Aim
 - "to show how men come to have property in several parts of that which God gave to mankind in common, and that without any express compact of all the commoners" (1/9)
 - social contract theory
 - philosophical justification of enclosure movement
 - "The fruit, or venison, which nourishes the wild **Indian**, who knows **no enclosure**, and is still a tenant in common, must be his, and so his, i.e. a part of him, that another can no longer have any right to it, before it can do him any good for the support of his life" (1/9)
 - Argument from (natural) reason
 - "men...have a right to their preservation...to meat and drink, and such other things as nature affords for their subsistence" (1/9)
 - cf. US Declaration of Independence
 - We hold these truths to be self-evident, that (i) all men are created equal, (ii) that they are endowed by their Creator with certain unalienable Rights, that among these are (a) Life, (b) Liberty and (c) the pursuit of Happiness
 - "The story goes that Jefferson, on the advice of Benjamin Franklin, substituted the phrase "pursuit of happiness" for the

word "property," which was favored by George Mason.

Franklin thought that "property" was too narrow a notion."²

- "In The Second Treatise, Locke lists the natural rights of "life, liberty, and estate," with "estate" being what we today would call "property."³

- "See John Locke, *The Second Treatise of Government*, Chapter V: Of Property § 27, and Chapter VII: Of Political or Civil Society § 87, in *The Selected Political Writings of John Locke* 28, 53 (Paul E. Sigmund ed., 2005)."

- Argument from revelation (Judeo-Christian biblical sources)

- "God, as King David says, Psal. cxv 16. has given the earth to the children of men ... in common" (1/9)

- Psalm, cxv 15: The heavens are the heavens of the LORD, But the earth He has given to the sons of men.

- **Labor Theory of Value** – infused in nature by man

- It is labor, then, which put the greatest part of value upon land, without which it would scarcely be worth anything..." (801a)

- Concept of Property – from that which is most proper to oneself

- "every man has property in his own person" (1/9)

- "definition of proper"

- verb: To apply or ascribe specially or exclusively; (in pass.) to be appropriate for, characteristic of, or proper to a person or thing.

- from Latin "proprius" – **one's own**, special"

- what is *properly* his (according to Locke)

- labor of body
- work of his hands

- Concept of private domain

- nature + something is his own

- removed from the *common state of nature*

- "Whatsoever, then, he removes out of the state that Nature hath provided and left in it, he hath mixed his labor with it, and joined to it something that is his own, and thereby makes it his property." (1)

- Labor is the distinction

- Legal justification

- Legal distinction involved in the justification of private property

- natural law

- a law derived solely from reason
 - an original law of nature

- positive law

- law derived from human social & political institutions

- How men might come to have private property

- God has given

² Kathleen Kennedy Townsend, "The Pursuit of Happiness: What the Founders Meant – And Didn't." *The Atlantic* Jun 20, 2011,

<https://www.theatlantic.com/business/archive/2011/06/the-pursuit-of-happiness-what-the-founders-meant-and-didnt/240708/>

³ Carli N. Conklin, The Origins of the Pursuit of Happiness, 7 *Wash. U. Jur. Rev.* 195 (2015), 195-262.

http://openscholarship.wustl.edu/law_jurisprudence/vol7/iss2/6/

- the world to man in common
 - no original private dominion
 - provides for the general subsistence of our kind
- the earth and all that is therein give to mankind to support and comfort their being
 - Religious justification
 - "God and his reason commanded him to subdue the earth, i.e., to improve it for the benefit of life" (3)
 - Rational justification
 - "the condition of human life, which requires labor and materials to work on, necessarily introduces private possessions" (3)
- **Labor removes things from original common state**
 - Labor = Improvement
 - Cf. Horse-servant equivalence, page 2
 - "the labor that was mine"
 - "The grass that the horse bit, the turfs that my servant cut ... become my property"
 - His (owner's) private right
 - **The 9/10's rule**
 - "of the products useful to the life of man nine tenths are the effects of labor (6)
 - "It is labor, then, which put the greatest part of value upon land, without which it would scarcely be worth anything..." (6)
 - Land left wholly to nature..."waste"
 - Benefits of enclosure
 - "therefore he that incloses the land, and has a greater plenty of conveniences of life from ten acres, than he could have from an hundred left to nature, may truly be said to give ninety acres to mankind" (4)
 - "by labor, as it were, does he inclose it from the common"(3)
 - Understanding of Native Americans
 - Rich in land
 - Poor in comforts
 - Cf. William Cronon, *Changes in the Land: Indians, Colonists, and the Ecology of New England*
- **Proto-Sustainability thesis**
 - "every man should have as much as he could make use of" (4)
 - "no right...farther than his use called for" (5)
 - Bounds set by reason (2)
 - Spoilage thesis
 - "as much as one can make use of to any advantage of life before it spoils" (2)
 - "he that leaves as much to another can make use of, does as good as take nothing at all" (3)
- Invention of **money** alters this scheme
 - **Gold** does not spoil
 - An invention established by mutual consent
 - **Function of money**
 - "they having, by a tacit and voluntary consent, found out, a way how man may fairly possess more land than he himself can use the

product of, by receiving in exchange for the overplus gold and silver, which may be hoarded up without injury to any one" (8)

- Gold and silver **may be hoarded**
- The property on which this wealth rests must be of use to mankind
 - Cf. Western water rights "use it or lose it"
 - <http://www.unce.unr.edu/publications/files/nr/2013/fs1339.pdf>
- Money allows for **appropriation of large tracts of land**
 - For the benefit of mankind generally
 - Presumption of immeasurable bounty
 - "there is land enough in the world to suffice double the inhabitants" (4)
 - "yet there are still great tracts of ground to be found, which ... lie waste" (7)
- **Function and aim of government** (6)
 - "the increase of lands, and the right employing of them is the great art of government"
 - "by established laws of liberty to secure protection and encouragement to the honest industry of mankind, against the oppression and narrowness of party"

Summation of Labor Theory of Property: Section 44 (page 7/9)

- "From all which it is evident, that though the things of nature are given in common, yet **man, by being master of himself, and proprietor of his own person, and the actions or labour of it, had still in himself the great foundation of property**; and that, which made up the great part of what he applied to the support or comfort of his being, when invention and arts had improved the conveniences of life, was perfectly his own, and did not belong in common to others."

II.C. René Descartes (1596-1650) - Theory of the Animal Machine (establishment of the mechanistic conception of the physical world)

Most Important Writings

- *Discourse on the Method* (1637)
- *Principles of Philosophy* (1641)
- *Meditations on First Philosophy* (1641)
- *Le Monde (The World)* – published posthumously

Heart of Descartes' Metaphysics

- Concept of **Substance**

- that which nothing else in order to exist
 - one unambiguous substance:
 - **God, i.e, uncreated being**
 - substance = needs nothing else in order to be
 - God, uncreated substance, needs nothing else in order to be
 - Therefore, God is substance in an *unequivocal* sense
 - Two substances in an equivocal sense
 - **created being**
 - these need only God in order to be
 - Therefore, created being is substance in an equivocal sense
 - **Mind** (or immortal soul)
 - principal attribute: thinking (power of judgment, reason)
 - famous discovery: cogito ergo sum
 - cogito – I think (or thinking)
 - wholly distinct from the body
 - **Matter** (or body)
 - principal attribute: extension (in space)
 - 23: "All the properties which we clearly perceive in it (i.e., matter) may be reduced to the one, viz. that it can be divided, or moved according to its parts, and consequently is capable of all these affections which we perceive can arise from the motion of its parts."⁴
- **Establishment of a Universal Mechanistic Theory of the Physical World**
 - Extended physical world
 - matter (bodies)
 - bodies in motion
 - Thought Experiment in the *Discourse*:
 - Chaos + laws of nature (observed) + idea of God's infinite perfection (innate) qua creator → rational account of the lawfully ordered natural world of our experience
 - laws of nature imputed by God
 - discovered by Reason
- **Meditations on First Philosophy**
 - Human beings composed of a soul and a body
 - Dualist metaphysics
 - Argument:
 - search for an apodictic foundation for knowledge
 - **cogito ergo sum**
I think, therefore I am
 - Proof that soul is united to body
 - Body, entirely material in nature
 - Designed
 - To be like us
 - God, master craftsman of the greatest sort (*Artifex maximus* - Canguilhem)
 - "machine made by God" (Treatise, 99)

⁴ *Ibid.*, 265.

- Soul united to whole body
 - not to a governing part of the part, but infused throughout whole of human body
 - No lower or higher soul, cf. article 47 (*Passions*)
- Fundamental Problem
 - "soul is of a nature which has no relation to extension...but only to the whole collection of its organs" (35)

The Animal - Machine

- Animals compared to **soulless moving machines**, i.e., automata (human technical creations) analogous to construction of the body of animals
 - **Divine construction** of much greater intricacy than anything producible by humans
 - "conception of the universe as an integrated whole explicable by universal mechanical principles applicable equally to organisms and to dead matter, to the microscopic particles and to the heavenly bodies"
 - Explanation of bodily functions "according to the rules of mechanics which are the same with those of nature" – Discourse V
 - they (**animals**) are **destitute of reason**, and that **it is nature which acts in them according to the disposition of their organs**: thus it is seen, that a clock composed only of wheels and weights can number the hours and measure time more exactly than we with all our skin."
 - incapable of self-motion (voluntary motion)
- Animals: nature's **automatons lacking in mind**
 - Brutes have **not less reason than man**, they have none at all
 - "two different principles of our movements are to be distinguished - the one entirely mechanical and corporeal which depends solely on the force of the animal spirits and the configuration of the bodily parts, and which we may call the corporeal soul, and the other incorporeal, that is to say, mind or soul, which you many define as a substance which thinks" (readings 27)
 - two certain tests animals are not rational
 - Language
 - "could never use words or other signs arranged in such a manner as is competent to us in order to declare our thoughts to others"
 - Reason
 - do not act from knowledge, but solely from the disposition of their organs"
 - reason is a universal instrument
 - organs are of a particular arrangement for each particular action.
 - "I **do not deny the life of any animal**, making it consist solely in the warmth of the heart." (readings 28)
- Physicalistic Explanation of Bodily Movement
 - **circulatory system of the blood** (not nervous system) by means of animal spirits (via nerves) change shape of muscles

- **Heart:** the engine of a hydrodynamic machine
 - Production of heat in the heart accounts for
 - Digestion of food
 - Circulation of blood
 - Rarefaction (into animal spirits) and condensation (into blood)
 - Rarefied blood, a very fine wind, pure flame – animal spirits
 - Nourishes the brain
 - Directs movement of muscles via the nerves by pulling or relaxing the musculature
- Pineal gland – responsible for discharge of animal spirits to muscles via nerves
 - Voluntary movement: will and volition
 - whether that be soul acting upon itself
 - When we will to love God
 - or where the soul acts on the body
 - when we will to walk
 - Conditioned movement: a function of the mechanism
 - Where the body is set into motion via an external object as mediated through the pineal gland
 - Reflex movement
 - pineal gland unnecessary medium